



New England Fishery Management Council

50 WATER STREET | NEWBURYPORT, MASSACHUSETTS 01950 | PHONE 978 465 0492 | FAX 978 465 3116

Eric Reid, *Chairman* | Thomas A. Nies, *Executive Director*

MEETING SUMMARY

Scallop Advisory Panel

October 26, 2021

Webinar Meeting

The Scallop Advisory Panel met via webinar on October 26, 2021 to: 1) review 2022 projection runs and provide input on the range of specifications alternatives to be included in Framework 34; 2) provide input on the range of alternatives to be included in Framework 34 including: default access area trips, part-time LA access area allocations, LAGC IFQ access area trips, Northern Gulf of Maine default specifications, measures to reduce fishery impacts; 3) receive an update on the on-going evaluation of rotational management; 4) provide recommendations on 2022 work priorities for the Scallop FMP; and 5) discuss other business.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Jim Gutowski (AP Chair), Jonathon Peros (Plan Coordinator), Sam Asci (Council staff), Kirk Larson, Ron Enoksen, Ed Mullis, Brent Fulcher, Kristan Porter, Ben Martens, Cassie Canastra, Chris Merl, Charlie Quinn, Paul Vafides, Mike Marchetti, Brady Lybarger, Jay Elsner, Bob Maxwell, Eric Hansen, Dr. Cate O’Keefe (Fishery Applications).

Melanie Griffin (Scallop Committee Chair) was in attendance on the webinar along with approximately 45 members of the public.

The meeting began at 9:01 AM. Advisory Panel Chair Jim Gutowski welcomed the AP, PDT, and members of the audience to the webinar. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, all Council related meetings have been transitioned to webinars including the Scallop AP and Committee meetings. Staff reviewed instructions for participating in the webinar and gave an overview of the goals and objectives for the day’s meeting.

Key Outcomes:

- The Advisory Panel recommended a range of specifications options for FY2022 to be included in Framework 34.
- The Advisory Panel recommended the development of default access area trips, part-time LA access area allocations, LAGC IFQ access area trips, Northern Gulf of Maine default specifications, measures to reduce fishery impacts in Framework 34.
- The Advisory Panel recommended a list of 2022 work priorities for the Scallop FMP.

Meeting materials can be accessed at [this link](#). Audio recordings of the full meeting can be provided upon request.

Framework 34 Specifications

Council reviewed key information that was presented to the SSC at their October 13, 2021 meeting. The OFL and ABC have declined for several years and are expected to be lower in 2022 and 2023. While there is always uncertainty with forecasts, the scallop projection model has been overly optimistic for some areas in recent years, and the Plan Development Team has recommended adjustments to try to help improve the performance of the forecast. Staff also explained changes to how scallop surveys in the Gulf of Maine are being accounted for in the 2022 OFL and ABC.

Council staff provided an overview of 2022 specifications runs that were tasked by the Committee in September 2021. The presentation focused on some of the trade-offs associated with different spatial management configurations for open bottom and access area fishing, and how the options compared to preferred alternatives from recent Council actions.

There was clarifying discussion around the LPUE assumptions used to project days-at-sea based on the F rates analyzed by the PDT (i.e., 0.3, 0.36, 24 DAS). There was some suggestion that the LPUE assumption for 2022 might be higher than reality, but that this would mean realized open area F would be lower than expected. The AP recommended two rotational management options and three days-at-sea allocation options to be considered in FW34 (see Motion 1 and Motion 2 below). The rotational management options both allocate three 15,000-pound trips (1 to the NLS-S and 2 to CAII), close the New York Bight area, and only differ in how the Hudson Canyon area is treated (i.e. one option reverts it to open bottom, the other closes it to the scallop fishery). The first option is consistent with the original range of runs tasked to the PDT in that it reverts the entire MAAA to open bottom. The second option was put forward based on the importance of Hudson Canyon to the fishery as well as protecting the area in the hopes it will bolster recruitment success. Those in support of keeping HC closed also mentioned that maintaining the area boundary will underscore the importance of this area to the scallop fishery to wind development interests. Dr. Hart noted that opening or closing Hudson Canyon results in a difference of less than one day at sea for FT LA vessels. The AP was unanimously in support of analyzing both options in FW34. There was also agreement in continuing trip trading in half trip increments to maintain flexibility, which for these options would be 7,500 pounds. Related to the idea of combining Closed Area II Southwest and Closed Area II East, it was noted that the recruits observed in CAII-East still have growth potential – several PDT members on the call suggested that this area will be important to support fishing effort in years beyond 2022.

For days-at-sea, the AP recommended three options for analysis: 24, 26, and 28 days (see Motion 3 and Motion 4 below). In Motion 3, the AP unanimously voted to set DAS at 24, with several members stating that they felt this was the correct number to allocate in 2022. A second motion was passed to explore a range of options, including the 24 DAS. There was general agreement with the PDT's point that increasing open area F above recent historic low levels is appropriate for 2022 given the conservation benefits gained from closing the New York Bight Area. It was also noted that the bulk of open area fishing will likely be on eastern Georges Bank and that having slightly higher days-at-sea could help offset the time used steaming to and from that part of the resource.

Motion 1: Lybarger/Fulcher

Recommend that the Committee tasks the PDT to develop an alternative in FW34 that would:

- Set FT LA possession limit at 15,000 pounds in all access areas.
- 3 Total FT LA AA trips:
 - 2 in CAII (SW and EXT as one area)
 - 1 in NLS-South
- Trip exchanges in 7,500 pound increments.
- In open bottom areas:
 - Closed Area I would be available for LAGC IFQ/RSA
 - NYB closure area would be closed
 - NLS-West would be closed
 - HCS area would be closed

Rationale: Keeping the same boundary of CAII access area with FW33 boundaries. Allowing trip trading at 7,500 lbs allows for more flexibility. NYB closure would be to improve yield per-recruit and help enhance source/sink dynamics. Taking three trips at 15,000 pounds would reduce removals of three trips to 15 million pounds, vs 18 million pounds of removals with the 18,000 pound trip limits.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Ben Martens	Yes			
Bob Maxwell	Yes			
Brady Lybarger	Yes			
Brent Fulcher	Yes			
Cassie Canastra	Yes			
Wes Brighton				
Charlie Quinn	Yes			
Chris Merl				
Ed Mullis	Yes			
Eric Hansen (VC)	Yes			
Jay Elsner	Yes			
Kirk Larson	Yes			
Kristen Porter	Yes			
Michael Marchetti	Yes			
Paul Vafides	Yes			
Ronnie Enoksen	Yes			
Tom Coley				
TOTAL VOTE	14	0	0	0

Motion 2: Larson/Fulcher

Recommend that the Committee tasks the PDT to develop an alternative in FW34 that would:

- Set FT LA possession limit at 15,000 pounds in all access areas.
- 3 Total FT LA AA trips:
 - 2 in CAII (SW and EXT as one area)
 - 1 in NLS-South
- Trip exchanges in 7,500 pound increments.
- In open bottom areas:
 - Closed Area I would be available for LAGC IFQ AA and RSA.
 - NYB closure area would be closed.
 - NLS-West would be closed

Rationale: This motion is the same as Motion 1, with Hudson Canyon as open bottom to give vessels in Mid-Atlantic more areas to fish with the NYB area closed.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Kirk Larson	YES			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Chris Merl				
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Ben Martens				
Jay Elsner	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	13		0	0

Motion 3: Lybarger/Mullis

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to develop specification alternatives in FW34 that set FT LA DAS at:

- 24 DAS

Rationale: Most of the fishing will be Georges Bank, setting FT DAS using this range affords southern vessels more time to steam to the fishing grounds. These DAS options are well below

the allowed F to set DAS at (F=0.61). Closing a large part of the Mid-Atlantic. Moving to a higher F is appropriate with 24 DAS. 24 DAS seems to be a number that works for members of the fishery.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Tom Coley				
TOTAL VOTE	15	0	0	0

Motion 4: Fulcher/Hansen

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to develop specification alternatives in FW34 that set FT LA DAS at:

- 24 DAS
- 26 DAS
- 28 DAS

Rationale: Most of the fishing will be Georges Bank, setting FT DAS using this range affords southern vessels more time to steam to the fishing grounds. These DAS options are well below the allowed F to set DAS at (F=0.61). Closing a large part of the Mid-Atlantic. Provide a range of F rates to consider.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Tom Coley				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	15	0	0	0

Other Alternatives For Inclusion in Framework 34

Discussion on other alternatives to consider in FW34 was brief and all motions passed unanimously (i.e., default trips, part time limited access allocations, IFQ access area trips, NGOM measures, and measures to reduce fishery impacts) (see Motion 5 – Motion 9, below). When discussing measures to reduce fishery impacts, the AP did not offer a recommendation to include alternatives that would extend the CAII seasonal closure. The group was not sure of the benefits gained by continuing the two-week extension used in 2020 and 2021, and also pointed out that the fishery will be subject to a reactive AM that will reduce GB YT and NWP bycatch next year.

Motion 5: Fulcher/Lybarger

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to include default measures for FY 2023 in FW34 that would allocate 1 access area trip Closed Area II (SW+EXT) at the trip limit specified for 2022 FY for the FT LA component.

Rationale: This would be in addition to the standard default measures. It is unlikely that the NLS-S can definitively support a trip in 2023. It is much more likely that CAII can support default fishing in 2023 based on the projections and current fishing conditions. This would be the same boundary that is used in FW34.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Tom Coley				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	15	0	0	0

Motion 6: Fulcher/Larson

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to develop measures in FW34 that would allocate Limited Access Part Time vessels 2 access area trips with a trip limit of 9,000 pounds:

- 1 trip in NLS-S at 9,000 lbs
- 1 trip in CAII at 9,000 lbs

Rationale: The PT vessels are smaller, have fewer crew. The CAII has highest level of exploitable biomass of access areas.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Kirk Larson	YES			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Cassie Canastra				

Brent Fulcher	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Ben Martens	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	14		0	0

Motion 7: Fulcher/Mullis

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to include alternatives in FW33 that would distribute the LAGC IFQ access area allocation from Closed Area II to other access areas (example of 714 trips):

- Evenly across all access areas.
 - NLS-S and Closed Area I
- All in Closed Area I

Rationale: This formula would be for allocations to CAII – the numbers specified in the motion may change if fewer trips are allocated to CAI. These options reflect how the Council has redistributed LAGC IFQ CAII allocations in the past. This creates two options.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Tom Coley				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra				
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	14	0	0	0

Motion 8: Porter/Martens

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to include default measures for the NGOM for FY 2023 in FW34 that would set the NGOM set-aside at 75% of NGOM set-aside specified for 2022 FY.

Rationale: The 75% approach keeps with the standard default approach used for the FT LA and LAGC IFQ components.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Tom Coley				
TOTAL VOTE	15	0	0	0

Motion 9: Lybarger/Elsner

Recommend that the Committee include an alternative in FW34 that would allow RSA compensation fishing in the following areas:

- Open Bottom
- Closed Area II with seasonal restrictions (Only open June 1 – August 15 for RSA)
- NLS-S
- Closed Area I
- NGOM management area (up to 25,000 in this area)

Rationale: This would allow vessels to spread out, and some research is done on compensation fishing. The RSA is important and should be supported with good options for catching the compensation pounds. The RSA has had issues in the past when fishery has not been able to operate in areas where it can catch scallops that receive a price to adequately support research.

June 1 – August 15 corresponds with the timing of low bycatch rates of northern windowpane and Georges Bank yellowtail in Closed Area II.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Tom Coley				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	15	0	0	0

Evaluation of Rotational Management Update

Dr. Cate O’Keefe (Fishery Applications) provided an update on progress to date on the evaluation of rotational management, which is a scallop work priority for 2021. The AP engaged in general discussion on the elements of rotational management that are being examined, such as:

- Consideration of how the 60-day carryover period for access area fishing might impact scallop yield – for example, if fishing in the carryover window would have instead occurred earlier in the season, greater impacts might be expected due to increased fishing in times with lower yield.
- There were several comments pointing out the elevated effort during the fall/winter of 2020 in the Mid-Atlantic Access Area that likely had significant impacts to the resource in that area. While the MAAA has been a popular place to fish in the fall/winter due to its close proximity to shore, the yield is the lowest during these seasons compared to the rest of the fishing year.
- Other related comments suggested that seasonal closures to improve yield should be considered when developing specifications.
- Considering the trend in the SAMS model overestimating biomass for the last several years, there was interesting in exploring how much of the missing biomass could be explained by discard and incidental mortality.

2022 Scallop Work Priorities

For 2022 priorities, the AP discussed the list of on-going and multiyear items and offered a ranked list of continued work and new priorities to be worked on in the coming year. Items 4-6 were added to the

original motion through a friendly amendment. Most of the discussion was focused on the #3 ranked priority, scoping for DAS and access area leasing in the scallop fishery. Several advisors felt that this should be ranked lower because there is a greater sense of urgency around other items, such as seeding and predator management, revisiting the DAS clock, and phase 2 of the evaluation of rotational management effort. Others felt strongly that the discussion around leasing should be started in the coming year. For the leasing priority, there were a few comments in support of starting “listening sessions” instead of “scoping” as it would allow the discussion to begin without committing the Council to taking action. Others were supportive of scoping noting that this process would have many opportunities to stop work on leasing if the Council wished to do so. Ultimately the AP moved forward the list of priorities as a recommendation to the Committee shown in Motion 10 (see below).

Motion 10: Fulcher/Mullis

Move that the Scallop AP recommend the following priorities, ranked in order of importance and in addition to the standing Staff/PDT requirements & ongoing work, to the Scallop Committee for 2022:

1. Prepare specifications package for FY 2023 (2024 default) specifications (i.e. setting DAS, access area trips, Northern GOM TAC, limited access general category IFQ allocations, etc.)
2. Complete ongoing actions (Framework 34, evaluate rotational management program, support action for access to Northern Edge HMA (see Habitat), including development of an access area program for modified area; continue work of scallop survey working group)
3. Initiate scoping for the development of a limited access vessel DAS and access area trip leasing program.
4. Revisit DAS clock counting system to address changes in resource distribution
5. Develop management and policy approaches for scallop seeding and grow out, including predator management
6. Continue work on the evaluation of rotational management (additional work after final report is delivered in January 2022)

Rationale: The motion adds new work priorities while ensuring that ongoing work will continue. The intent is to match workload with available staff time. The new priority of developing a DAS and AA trip leasing program is supported by the vast majority of limited access vessels, as demonstrated by the signed letters submitted to the Council. A leasing program will provide vessel owners with much needed operational flexibility while achieving significant climate benefits. The AP has prioritized a leasing program for the past several years.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Paul Vafides			Abstain	
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner		No		
Tom Coley				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Wes Brighton				
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl		No		
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)		No		
TOTAL VOTE	11	3	1	0

Other Business

Under other business, a member of the public suggested that shucking machines should be allowed to harvest the small scallops in the southern range of the fishery that tend to die off before recruiting to the fishery. No other business was discussed. The meeting adjourned at 4:12 PM.



New England Fishery Management Council

50 WATER STREET | NEWBURYPORT, MASSACHUSETTS 01950 | PHONE 978 465 0492 | FAX 978 465 3116

Eric Reid, *Chairman* | Thomas A. Nies, *Executive Director*

MEETING SUMMARY

Scallop Committee Meeting

October 27, 2021

Webinar Meeting

The Scallop Committee met via webinar on October 27, 2021 to: 1) review 2022 projection runs and provide input on the range of specifications alternatives to be included in Framework 34; 2) provide input on the range of alternatives to be included in Framework 34 including: default access area trips, part-time LA access area allocations, LAGC IFQ access area trips, Northern Gulf of Maine default specifications, measures to reduce fishery impacts; 3) receive an update on the on-going evaluation of rotational management; 4) provide recommendations on 2022 work priorities for the Scallop FMP; and 5) discuss other business.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Melanie Griffin (Scallop Committee Chair), Jonathon Peros (Plan Coordinator), Sam Asci (Council staff), Michelle Duval, Mark Alexander (Vice-chair), Matt Gates, Renee Zobel, John Pappalardo, Melissa Smith, Mike Sissenwine, Togue Brawn, Libby Etrie, and Peter Hughes.

Eric Reid (Council Chair) and Jim Gutowski (AP Chair) were in attendance on the webinar along with approximately 32 members of the public.

The meeting began at 9:02 AM. Scallop Committee Chair Melanie Griffin welcomed the Committee and members of the audience to the webinar. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, all Council related meetings have been transitioned to webinars including the Scallop Committee and Council meetings. Mr. James Gutowski (AP Chair) provided a brief overview of the October 26, 2021 Advisory Panel meeting.

Key Outcomes:

- The Committee recommended a range of specifications options for FY2022 to be included in Framework 34.
- The Committee recommended the development of default access area trips, part-time LA access area allocations, LAGC IFQ access area trips, Northern Gulf of Maine default specifications, measures to reduce fishery impacts in Framework 34.
- The Committee recommended a list of 2022 work priorities for the Scallop FMP.

Meeting materials can be accessed at [this link](#). Audio recordings of the full meeting can be provided upon request.

Framework 34 Specifications

Council staff reviewed key information that was presented to the SSC at their October 13, 2021 meeting. The OFL and ABC have declined for several years, and are expected to be lower in 2022 and 2023. While there is always uncertainty with forecasts, the scallop projection model has been overly optimistic for some areas in recent years, and the Plan Development Team has recommended adjustments to try to help improve the performance of the forecast. Staff also explained changes to how scallop surveys in the Gulf of Maine are being accounted for in the 2022 OFL and ABC.

Staff provided an overview of 2022 specifications runs that were tasked by the Committee in September 2021. The presentation focused on some of the trade-offs associated with different spatial management configurations for open bottom and access area fishing, and how the options compared to preferred alternatives from recent Council actions.

Following the presentation, there was a comment noting the uncertainty between projected and observed biomass in 2021 and a suggestion that this is a reason why two-year specifications are not ideal.

Related to days-at-sea, AP chair Jim Gutowski expanded on the AP recommendation for 24, 26, and 28 DAS. The AP seemed to be in support of the 24 DAS option but wanted to analyze a range of options to consider at final action. It was noted that the PDT had not yet analyzed DAS options greater than 24, and that the PDT would probably be uncomfortable pushing open area F much higher than estimated for 24 DAS (i.e., 0.39).

Consistent with the AP's recommendation from the day before, the Committee tasked the PDT with including two rotational management options in Framework 34. The Committee also tasked two days-at-sea options to be included in Framework 34 (i.e., 20 and 26 days). This recommendation came together over a series of motions and motion amendments. The Committee agreed on the rotational management options recommended by the AP. There was some disagreement on the days at sea options that should be included in Framework 34. There were several Committee members that expressed concern around the higher end of the AP recommendation (i.e., 26 and 28 DAS), suggesting that these options would result in the open area being fished too hard. Others noted that the 26 and 28 DAS options still fall below the open area F rates employed in 2015-2016 and felt that higher DAS should be considered for 2022 given the declining biomass and expected allocations in access areas. Several Committee members were sensitive to the geographic distribution of the scallop fleet relative to eastern Georges Bank, where the bulk of open area fishing is likely to occur; they felt that slightly higher DAS options would help offset the longer steam times to eastern GB for those vessels in the southern range of the fishery. Ultimately, the Committee came to agreement on including two DAS options in Framework 34: 20 DAS and 26 DAS, with the understanding that the Committee could select a final preferred recommendation within the range of those two options.

Another motion was put forward to include specification alternatives that reflect the AP's recommendation and Committees earlier recommendation under Motion 4, but with an 18,000-pound trip limit. There were a few brief comments against this idea, and Motion 5 failed due to lack of a second.

Motion 1: Hughes/Alexander

Move that the Committee task the PDT to develop alternatives in FW34 that would allocate the following Access Area trips and Full Time Limited Access DAS:

	"Hudson Canyon Open" AP Motion 2, AP Motion 3	"Hudson Canyon Closed" AP Motion 1, AP Motion 3
Open Area F/DAS	?	?
Total FT LA Trips	3	3
FT LA Trip Limit	15,000 lbs	15,000 lbs
Trips trading increments	7,500 lbs	7,500 lbs
CL2-SE	CLOSED	CLOSED
CLS-SW	30,000 lbs (2 trips)	30,000 lbs (2 trips)
CL2-Ext		
NLS-South	15,000 lbs (1 trip)	15,000 lbs (1 trip)
NLS-North	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-West	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-Triangle	CLOSED	CLOSED
CL2-N (HAPC)	CLOSED	CLOSED
CA1	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA
NYB	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE
HCS	Open Bottom	CLOSED
NF, GSC, SF, BI, LI, MAB- Nearshore, DMV, ET Flex, ET Open, Stellwagen South, NYB- Inshore	Open Bottom	Open Bottom
West of NLS-W (Non-SAMS)	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE

Rationale: A 5 million pound trip in the NLS-S area is projected to result in a F rate of 0.31, while a 18,000 pound trip is projected to result in a F rate of 0.4. There are still four million pounds left to land from this area, and it is prudent to be conservative at this time. Both alternatives keep the CAII access area boundary consistent with the FW33 boundary by combining CAII-SW and CAII-EXT into one area. Allowing trip trading at 7,500 lbs allows for more flexibility. NYB closure would be to improve yield per-recruit and help enhance source/sink dynamics. Taking three trips at 15,000 pounds would reduce removals of three trips to 15 million pounds, vs 18 million pounds. The Hudson Canyon Open run gives vessels in Mid-Atlantic more areas to fish with the NYB area closed. The Hudson Canyon area has been an important and productive region for the scallop fishery.

2. Motion to Amend: Smith and Gates [Added DAS options at 20 and 24 DAS]

Move that the Committee task the PDT to develop alternatives in FW34 that would allocate the following Access Area trips and Full Time Limited Access DAS:

	"Hudson Canyon Open" AP Motion 2, AP Motion 3	"Hudson Canyon Closed" AP Motion 1, AP Motion 3
Open Area F/DAS	20 & 24	20 & 24
Total FT LA Trips	3	3
FT LA Trip Limit	15,000 lbs	15,000 lbs
Trips trading increments	7,500 lbs	7,500 lbs
CL2-SE	CLOSED	CLOSED
CLS-SW	30,000 lbs (2 trips)	30,000 lbs (2 trips)
CL2-Ext		
NLS-South	15,000 lbs (1 trip)	15,000 lbs (1 trip)
NLS-North	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-West	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-Triangle	CLOSED	CLOSED
CL2-N (HAPC)	CLOSED	CLOSED
CA1	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA
NYB	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE
HCS	Open Bottom	CLOSED
NF, GSC, SF, BI, LI, MAB- Nearshore, DMV, ET Flex, ET Open, Stellwagen South, NYB- Inshore	Open Bottom	Open Bottom
West of NLS-W (Non-SAMS)	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA		No		
Melissa Smith, ME	Yes			
Libby Etric, MA	Yes			
Renee Zobel, NH	Yes			
Matt Gates, CT		No		
Togue Brawn, ME	Yes			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC		No		
Peter Hughes, MAFMC		No		
Mark Alexander (VC)		No		
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)			Abstain	
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	Yes			
TOTAL VOTE	5	5	0	0

The motion failed 5-5 with one abstention.
Back to the main motion.

3. Motion to Amend: Hughes/Gates [Added DAS options at 20 and 26 DAS]

Move that the Committee task the PDT to develop alternatives in FW34 that would allocate the following Access Area trips and Full Time Limited Access DAS:

	"Hudson Canyon Open" AP Motion 2, AP Motion 3	"Hudson Canyon Closed" AP Motion 1, AP Motion 3
Open Area F/DAS	20 & 26	20 & 26
Total FT LA Trips	3	3
FT LA Trip Limit	15,000 lbs	15,000 lbs
Trips trading increments	7,500 lbs	7,500 lbs
CL2-SE	CLOSED	CLOSED
CLS-SW	30,000 lbs (2 trips)	30,000 lbs (2 trips)
CL2-Ext		
NLS-South	15,000 lbs (1 trip)	15,000 lbs (1 trip)
NLS-North	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-West	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-Triangle	CLOSED	CLOSED
CL2-N (HAPC)	CLOSED	CLOSED
CA1	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA
NYB	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE
HCS	Open Bottom	CLOSED
NF, GSC, SF, BI, LI, MAB- Nearshore, DMV, ET Flex, ET Open, Stellwagen South, NYB- Inshore	Open Bottom	Open Bottom
West of NLS-W (Non-SAMS)	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE

Rationale: A 5 million pound trip in the NLS-S area is projected to result in a F rate of 0.31, while a 18,000 pound trip is projected to result in a F rate of 0.4. There are still four million pounds left to land from this area, and it is prudent to be conservative at this time. Both alternatives keep the CAII access area boundary consistent with the FW33 boundary by combining CAII-SW and CAII-EXT into one area. Allowing trip trading at 7,500 lbs allows for more flexibility. NYB closure would be to improve yield per-recruit and help enhance source/sink dynamics. Taking three trips at 15,000 pounds would reduce removals of three trips to 15 million pounds, vs 18 million pounds. The Hudson Canyon Open run gives vessels in Mid-Atlantic more areas to fish with the NYB area closed. The Hudson Canyon area has been an important and productive region for the scallop fishery.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA	Yes			
Melissa Smith, ME	Yes			
Libby Etrie, MA	Yes			
Renee Zobel, NH	Yes			

Matt Gates, CT	Yes			
Togue Brawn, ME	Yes			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	10	0	0	0

The motion to amend carried on a roll call vote.

Motion 4: Main motion as amended (see #3):

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	10	0	0	0

The main motion, as amended, carried on a roll call vote.

Motion 5: Hughes/

Move that the Committee task the PDT to develop alternatives in FW34 that would allocate the following Access Area trips and Full Time Limited Access DAS:

	"Hudson Canyon Open" AP Motion 2, AP Motion 3	"Hudson Canyon Closed" AP Motion 1, AP Motion 3
Open Area F/DAS	20 - 26	20 - 26
Total FT LA Trips	3	3
FT LA Trip Limit	18,000 lbs	18,000 lbs
Trips trading increments	9,000 lbs	9,000 lbs
CL2-SE	CLOSED	CLOSED
CLS-SW	36,000 lbs (2 trips)	36,000 lbs (2 trips)
CL2-Ext		
NLS-South	18,000 lbs (1 trip)	18,000 lbs (1 trip)
NLS-North	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-West	CLOSED	CLOSED
NLS-Triangle	CLOSED	CLOSED
CL2-N (HAPC)	CLOSED	CLOSED
CA1	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA	LAGC IFQ AA/RSA
NYB	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE
HCS	Open Bottom	CLOSED
NF, GSC, SF, BI, LI, MAB- Nearshore, DMV, ET Flex, ET Open, Stellwagen South, NYB- Inshore	Open Bottom	Open Bottom
West of NLS-W (Non-SAMS)	NEW CLOSURE	NEW CLOSURE

The motion failed for a lack of a second.

Other Alternatives For Inclusion in Framework 34

Discussion on other alternatives to consider in FW34 was brief and all motions passed unanimously (i.e., default trips, PT allocations, IFQ access area trips, NGOM measures, and measures to reduce fishery impacts) (see Motion 6 – Motion 11, below). Under default measures, there was an initial suggestion to include two options for a 2023 default access area trip; however, discussion pointed out that this was unnecessary in that if the Council changed its mind on whether the fishery should have a 2023 default trip, it could do so by developing a payback measure to prevent people from fishing the trip when developing 2023 specifications.

When discussing measures to reduce fishery impacts, the Committee focused on whether or not the extended CAII seasonal closure alternatives should be included in Framework 34 (Motion 11). There were some questions on the data used for seasonal bycatch analyses that the closure extension was based on for FY2020 and FY2021. Staff noted the limitations associated with observer data in CAII for the past several years, either because the fishery was not operating in CAII or because observer coverage was waived during the pandemic. A member of the audience felt that other data sources, such as the Coonamessett Farm Foundation seasonal survey of eastern Georges Bank, should be used to inform the timing of the CAII closure. Staff noted that revisiting the timing of the CAII seasonal closure would take more time and resources than are typically planned for a normal specifications cycle and that this work would need to be prioritized by the Council in the future. Ultimately the motion regarding including options in Framework 34 to extend the CAII seasonal closure failed.

Motion 6: Alexander/Brawn

Task the PDT to include default measures for FY 2023 in FW34 that would allocate 1 access area trip Closed Area II (SW+EXT) at the trip limit specified for 2022 FY for the FT LA component.

Rationale: This would be in addition to the standard default measures. It is unlikely that the NLS-S can definitively support a trip in 2023. It is much more likely that CAII can support default fishing in 2023 based on the projections and current fishing conditions. This would be the same boundary that is used in FW34. The PDT should develop payback options in FW34 that would address a scenario in which the trip is deemed unviable in 2023.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	10	0	0	0

Motion 7: Hughes/Duval

The Committee task the PDT to develop measures in FW34 that would allocate Limited Access Part Time vessels 2 access area trips with a trip limit of 9,000 pounds:

- 1 trip in NLS-S at 9,000 lbs
- 1 trip in CAII at 9,000 lbs

Rationale: The part time vessels tend to be smaller vessels, have fewer crew. The CAII has highest level of exploitable biomass of access areas. The PT allocation for the year is 18,000 pounds. Increasing the trip limit from 40% of 15,000 lbs to reduce the number of trips required to harvest the allocation.

The motion carried without objection.

Motion 8: Pappalardo/Smith

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to include alternatives in FW34 that would distribute the LAGC IFQ access area allocation from Closed Area II to other access areas (example of 714 trips):

- Evenly across all access areas.
 - NLS-S and Closed Area I
- All in Closed Area I

Rationale: This formula would be for allocations to CAII – the numbers specified in the motion may change if fewer trips are allocated to CAI. These options reflect how the Council has redistributed LAGC IFQ CAII allocations in the past. This would create two options.

The motion carried without objection.

Motion 9: Brawn/Zobel

Recommend that the Committee task the PDT to include default measures for the NGOM for FY 2023 in FW34 that would set the NGOM set-aside at 75% of NGOM set-aside specified for 2022 FY.

Rationale: The 75% approach keeps with the standard default approach used for the FT LA and LAGC IFQ components. The F rates being developed in FW34 are conservative.

The motion carried without objection.

Motion 10: Hughes/Alexander

Recommend that the Committee include an alternative in FW34 that would allow RSA compensation fishing in the following areas:

- Open Bottom
- Closed Area II with seasonal restrictions (Only open June 1 – August 15 for RSA)
- NLS-S
- Closed Area I
- NGOM management area (up to 25,000 in this area)

Rationale: This would allow vessels to spread out, and some research is done on compensation fishing. The RSA is important and should be supported with good options for catching the compensation pounds. The RSA has had issues in the past when fishery has not been able to operate in areas where it can catch scallops that receive a price to adequately support research. June 1 – August 15 corresponds with the timing of low bycatch rates of northern windowpane and Georges Bank yellowtail in Closed Area II.

The motion carried without objection.

Motion 11: Etrie/Smith

Move that the Committee task the PDT to develop measures in FW34 to mitigate impacts on flatfish based on estimated bycatch of GB Yellowtail in FY2022. The PDT should focus on using seasonal closures, and the benefits of a seasonal closure from Aug. 15 – Nov. 30.

Rationale: The sub-ACL for GB yellowtail will be ~19 mt for FY2022. There are options for 2 trips to CAII (SW and EXT) and RSA compensation fishing. This would include examining the benefits of continuing the two-week closure at the end of November (Nov. 16 – Nov. 30). The closure would apply to the CAII SW and EXT. This is to add options to the Framework for consideration at final action in December.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA		NO		
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT		NO		
Togue Brawn, ME		NO		
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC		NO		
Mark Alexander (VC)		NO		
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA		NO		
TOTAL VOTE	4	6	0	0

Evaluation of Rotational Management Update

Council staff presented an update on the evaluation of rotational management, which is an on-going work priority for 2021. Discussion was relatively brief following the presentation. There was some discussion around how the results/recommendations from the evaluation of rotational management, along with other on-going work items such as the Scallop Survey Working Group, might be integrated into management. Staff noted that some of the recommendations that come out of this report could be addressed in a future framework action or an amendment. There was another clarifying question around the potential for doing a Management Strategy Evaluation (MSE) within the scope of the evaluation of rotational management – Staff noted that doing an MSE is not in the current scope of work, but that it could be pursued through a future iteration of the project should the Council elect to continue working on this topic.

2022 Scallop Work Priorities

Council staff began the discussion with a recap of work completed toward the 2021 priorities and presented a timetable showing when scallop related projects led by the Northeast Fisheries Science Center (ex: review of projection models, research track assessment) and Council (ex: frameworks, RSA, etc.) are likely to happen over the next four years.

For 2022 priorities, the Committee discussed the list of on-going and multiyear items, and offered a ranked list of continued work and new priorities recommended for the coming year (see Motion 14). There was extensive discussion around the potential priority related to development of a 3 to 5 year strategic plan for the Scallop FMP. Many offered their thoughts on how to develop a strategic plan, such as engaging stakeholders and the Council in a public process to determine what scallop-related issues are most important to work on, and the order in which these issues should be addressed. Some noted that there is a lot of work underway that would be informative to development of a strategic plan, such as the evaluation of rotational management and Scallop Survey Working Group; they felt it would be premature to start work on a strategic plan without having the final products of these projects on hand.

Ultimately the Committee moved forward with the AP recommendation for ranked priorities (see Motion 14 below). For the limited access days at sea and access area leasing item (#3 on the list), there was clarification that the Committee was voting to do scoping (following a notice of intent and development of a scoping document), and not listening sessions. Committee members and members of the public spoke both for and against the ranking of the leasing priority, with those against the high ranking feeling that other items on the list are more urgent to address. A motion to amend was passed to include another work item to the AP's recommended list: "Update seasonal bycatch closures analysis with new data, if available, for Georges Bank yellowtail and Northern windowpane flounder". Addition of this item followed discussion earlier in the meeting related to extending the CAII seasonal closure.

Motion 12: Pappalardo/Brawn

Move that the Scallop Committee recommend the following priorities, ranked in order of importance and in addition to the standing Staff/PDT requirements & ongoing work:

1. Prepare specifications package for FY 2023 (2024 default) specifications (i.e. setting DAS, access area trips, Northern GOM TAC, limited access general category IFQ allocations, etc.)
2. Complete ongoing actions (Framework 34, evaluate rotational management program, support action for access to Northern Edge HMA (see Habitat), including development of an access area program for modified area; continue work of scallop survey working group)
3. Initiate scoping for the development of a limited access vessel DAS and access area trip leasing program.
4. Revisit DAS clock counting system to address changes in resource distribution
5. Develop management and policy approaches for scallop seeding and grow out, including predator management
6. Continue work on the evaluation of rotational management (additional work after final report is delivered in January 2022)

Rationale: The motion adds new work priorities while ensuring that ongoing work will continue. The intent is to match workload with available staff time. The new priority of developing a DAS and AA trip leasing program is supported by the vast majority of limited access vessels, as demonstrated by the signed letters submitted to the Council. A leasing program will provide vessel owners with much needed operational flexibility while achieving significant climate benefits. The AP has prioritized a leasing program for the past several years.

13. Motion to Amend: Etrie/Smith [Added #7 to the list – new possible priority]

Move that the Scallop Committee recommend the following priorities, ranked in order of importance and in addition to the standing Staff/PDT requirements & ongoing work:

1. Prepare specifications package for FY 2023 (2024 default) specifications (i.e. setting DAS, access area trips, Northern GOM TAC, limited access general category IFQ allocations, etc.)
2. Complete ongoing actions (Framework 34, evaluate rotational management program, support action for access to Northern Edge HMA (see Habitat), including development of an access area program for modified area; continue work of scallop survey working group)
3. Initiate scoping for the development of a limited access vessel DAS and access area trip leasing program.
4. Revisit DAS clock counting system to address changes in resource distribution
5. Develop management and policy approaches for scallop seeding and grow out, including predator management
6. Continue work on the evaluation of rotational management (additional work after final report is delivered in January 2022)
7. Update seasonal bycatch closures analysis with new data, if available, for Georges Bank yellowtail and Northern windowpane flounder

Rationale: The motion adds new work priorities while ensuring that ongoing work will continue. The intent is to match workload with available staff time. The new priority of developing a DAS and AA trip leasing program is supported by the vast majority of limited access vessels, as demonstrated by the signed letters submitted to the Council. A leasing program will provide vessel owners with much needed operational flexibility while achieving significant climate benefits. The AP has prioritized a leasing program for the past several years. While there may be data limitations for changing the seasonal bycatch closure, other data is available that can inform this discussion. The resource appears to be moving north and east, and there is more scallop fishing happening on Georges Bank.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	10	0	0	0

14. Main motion as amended

Move that the Scallop Committee recommend the following priorities, ranked in order of importance and in addition to the standing Staff/PDT requirements & ongoing work:

1. Prepare specifications package for FY 2023 (2024 default) specifications (i.e. setting DAS, access area trips, Northern GOM TAC, limited access general category IFQ allocations, etc.)
2. Complete ongoing actions (Framework 34, evaluate rotational management program, support action for access to Northern Edge HMA (see Habitat), including development of an access area program for modified area; continue work of scallop survey working group)
3. Initiate scoping for the development of a limited access vessel DAS and access area trip leasing program.
4. Revisit DAS clock counting system to address changes in resource distribution
5. Develop management and policy approaches for scallop seeding and grow out, including predator management
6. Continue work on the evaluation of rotational management (additional work after final report is delivered in January 2022)
7. Update seasonal bycatch closures analysis with new data, if available, for Georges Bank yellowtail and Northern windowpane flounder

Rationale: The motion adds new work priorities while ensuring that ongoing work will continue. The intent is to match workload with available staff time. The new priority of developing a DAS and AA trip leasing program is supported by the vast majority of limited access vessels, as demonstrated by the signed letters submitted to the Council. A leasing program will provide vessel owners with much needed operational flexibility while achieving significant climate benefits. The AP has prioritized a leasing program for the past several years. While there may be data limitations for changing the seasonal bycatch closure, other data is available that can inform this discussion. The resource appears to be moving north and east, and there is more scallop fishing happening on Georges Bank.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO				
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA		NO		
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	9	1	0	0

Other Business

There was brief discussion under other business around supporting carryover fishing in FY2022 under options that would revert the MAAA to open bottom. The Committee was in agreement that the PDT should consider this issue when developing and analyzing specification alternatives in Framework 34 (see Motion 15 below).

Motion 15: Hughes/Pappalardo

The Committee tasks the PDT to develop measures in FW34 to keep the areas that constitute the MAAA (ET Flex, ET Open, HCS) closed until May 31, 2022, and then revert to open bottom.

Rationale: This will provide clarity on how the MAAA will transition to open bottom. There are low catch rates in the MAAA right now, and this affords vessels the opportunity to catch their carryover trips.

The motion carried without objection.

No other business was discussed. The meeting adjourned at 4:02 pm.