Draft Framework Adjustment 58 To the Northeast Multispecies FMP

Prepared by the
New England Fishery Management Council
In consultation with the
Mid-Atlantic Fishery Management Council
National Marine Fisheries Service

Initial Framework Meeting:
Final Framework Meeting:
Date Submitted:
Date Resubmitted:

June 13, 2018
December 5, 2018
January XX, 2019
TBD, 2019

4.0 **DRAFT** ALTERNATIVES UNDER CONSIDERATION

- 4.1 Updates to Formal Rebuilding Program and Annual Catch Limits
- 4.1.1 Formal Rebuilding Program
- 4.1.1.1 Georges Bank Winter Flounder Rebuilding Strategy
 - 4.1.1.1.1 Option 1: No Action

No Action. *Option 1/No Action- previously thought to rebuild by 2017* - Fishing mortality will target rebuilding of the stock with a 75 percent probability of success by 2017, according to Amendment 16 calculations. Amendment 16 implemented the rebuilding plan.

4.1.1.1.2 Option 2: Revised Rebuilding Strategy for Georges Bank Winter Flounder

XXX

- 4.1.1.2 Southern New England/Mid-Atlantic Yellowtail Flounder Rebuilding Strategy
 - 4.1.1.2.1 Option 1: No Action

No Action. *Option 1/No Action- previously thought to rebuild by 2014 and rebuilt as of 2011* – The rebuilding program was developed to rebuild the stock with a median (50 percent) probability by 2014. Amendment 13 implemented the rebuilding plan.

4.1.1.2.2 Option 2: Revised Rebuilding Strategy for Southern New England/Mid-Atlantic Yellowtail Flounder

XXX

- 4.1.1.3 Witch Flounder Rebuilding Strategy
 - 4.1.1.3.1 Option 1: No Action

No Action. *Option 1/No Action- previously thought to rebuild by 2017* - Fishing mortality targeted rebuilding of the stock with a 75 percent probability of success by 2017, based on Amendment 16 calculations. Amendment 16 implemented the rebuilding plan.

4.1.1.3.2 Option 2: Revised Rebuilding Strategy for Witch Flounder

XXX

4.1.1.4 Northern Windowpane Flounder Rebuilding Strategy

4.1.1.4.1 Option 1: No Action

No Action. Option 1/No Action - previously expected to rebuild by 2017 - The goal was to rebuild this stock by 2017. No probability was associated with this goal since it was an index-based stock and the projection methodology was deterministic. In addition, the Council did not identify a specific rebuilding mortality target because the GARM III panel concluded that given the high uncertainty of index-based assessments, it was not appropriate to calculate $F_{rebuild}$ for this stock. Amendment 16 implemented the rebuilding plan.

4.1.1.4.2 Option 2: Revised Rebuilding Strategy for Northern Windowpane Flounder

XXX

4.1.1.5 Ocean Pout Rebuilding Strategy

4.1.1.5.1 Option 1: No Action

No Action. *Option 1/No Action- rebuild by 2014* – The rebuilding program was developed to rebuild the stock with a median (50 percent) probability by 2014. Amendment 13 implemented the rebuilding plan.

4.1.1.5.2 Option 2: Revised Rebuilding Strategy for Ocean Pout

XXX

4.1.2 <u>Annual Catch Limits</u>

4.1.2.1 Option 1: No Action

No Action. There would be no changes to the specifications for FY 2019 – FY 2020 (Table 2). Default specifications would be in effect from May 1, 2019, to July 31, 2019, and would equal 35% of the FY 2018 catch limits, which would only be necessary for Eastern GB cod and would use FY2018 catch limits as a basis for also adjusting GB cod for expected Canadian catches. All other stocks have FY2019 specifications. There would be no FY2019 quotas specified for the transboundary Georges Bank stocks (i.e. GB cod, GB haddock, GB yellowtail flounder), which are managed through the US/CA Resource Sharing Understanding. These quotas are specified annually.

Rationale: The No Action alternative uses overfishing limits (OFLs)/acceptable biological catches (ABCs)/annual catch limits (ACLs) adopted in FW57. These values are based on the most recent assessments for most stocks. However, the most recent assessments for Eastern GB cod, Eastern GB haddock, and GB yellowtail flounder occurred in 2018

Table 2 - No Action/Option 1 Northeast Multispecies OFLs, ABCs, ACLs, and other ACL sub-components for FY2019-FY2020 (metric tons, live weight), adjusted for 2018 sector rosters as in the final rule for FW57, published May 1, 2018. Values are rounded to the nearest metric ton.

| Stock | Year | OFL | US ABC | State Waters Sub- Component | Other sub- components | Scallops | Groundfish Sub-ACL | Comm. Ground-fish Sub-ACL | Rec Ground- fish Sub-ACL | Preliminary Sectors Sub-ACL | Preliminary Non-sector Ground-fish | MWT or Small mesh Sub-ACL | Total ACL |
|--------------------|------|---------|--------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------|----------|-----------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|--------------|
| GB Cod | 2019 | 3,047 | 2,285 | 23 | 206 | | 1,954 | 1,954 | | 1,914 | 40 | | 2,182 |
| | 2020 | 3,047 | 2,285 | 23 | 206 | | 1,954 | 1,954 | | 1,914 | 40 | | 2,182 |
| GOM Cod | 2019 | 938 | 703 | 47 | 9 | | 610 | 390 | 220 | 378 | 12 | | 666 |
| | 2020 | 938 | 703 | 47 | 9 | | 610 | 390 | 220 | 378 | 12 | | 666 |
| GB Haddock | 2019 | 99,757 | 48,714 | 487 | 487 | | 44,659 | 44,659 | | 44,340 | 319 | 680 | 46,312 |
| | 2020 | 100,825 | 73,114 | 731 | 731 | | 67,027 | 67,027 | | 66,549 | 478 | 1,020 | 69,509 |
| GOM | 2019 | 16,038 | 12,490 | 91 | 91 | | 11,506 | 8,312 | 3,194 | 8,219 | 93 | 116 | 11,803 |
| Haddock | 2020 | 13,020 | 10,186 | 74 | 74 | | 9,384 | 6,779 | 2,605 | 6,703 | 76 | 95 | 9,626 |
| GB | 2019 | | 300 | | | 47 | 239 | 239 | | 235 | 4 | 6 | 291 |
| Yellowtail | 2020 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Flounder | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| SNE/MA | 2019 | 90 | 68 | 2 | 17 | 15 | 32 | 32 | | 26 | 6 | | 66 |
| Yellowtail | 2020 | 90 | 68 | 2 | 17 | 16 | 31 | 31 | | 25 | 6 | | 66 |
| Flounder | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CC/GOM | 2019 | 736 | 511 | 51 | 41 | | 398 | 398 | | 381 | 17 | | 490 |
| Yellowtail | 2020 | 848 | 511 | 51 | 41 | | 398 | 398 | | 381 | 17 | | 490 |
| Flounder | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| American | 2019 | 2,099 | 1,609 | 32 | 32 | | 1,467 | 1,467 | | 1,442 | 26 | | 1,532 |
| Plaice | 2020 | 1,945 | 1,492 | 30 | 30 | | 1,361 | 1,361 | | 1,337 | 24 | | 1,420 |
| Witch | 2019 | | 993 | 40 | 60 | | 849 | 849 | | 831 | 18 | | 948 |
| Flounder | 2020 | 1 102 | 993 | 40 | 60 | | 849 | 849 | | 831 | 18 | | 948 |
| GB Winter | 2019 | 1,182 | 810 | | 57 | | 731 | 731 | | 725 | 6 | | 787 |
| Flounder | 2020 | 1,756 | 810 | | 57 | | 731 | 731 | | 725 | 6 | | 787 |
| GOM Winter | 2019 | 596 | 447 | 67 | 4 | | 357 | 357 | | 339 | 18 | | 428 |
| Flounder | 2020 | 596 | 447 | 67 | 4 | | 357 | 357 | | 339 | 18 | | 428 |
| SNE/MA | 2019 | 1,228 | 727 | 73 | 109 | | 518 | 518 | | 456 | 62 | | 700 |
| Winter Flounder | 2020 | 1,228 | 727 | 73 | 109 | | 518 | 518 | | 456 | 62 | | 700 |

| Stock | Year | OFL | US ABC | State Waters Sub- Component | Other sub- | Scallops | Groundfish Sub-ACL | Comm. Ground-fish Sub-ACL | Rec Ground- fish Sub-ACL | Preliminary Sectors Sub-ACL | Preliminary Non-sector Ground-fish | MWT or Small mesh Sub-ACL | Total ACL |
|------------------------|------|--------|--------|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|-----------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|--------------|
| Redfish | 2019 | 15,640 | 11,785 | 118 | 118 | | 10,972 | 10,972 | | 10,921 | 51 | | 11,208 |
| | 2020 | 15,852 | 11,942 | 119 | 119 | | 11,118 | 11,118 | | 11,066 | 52 | | 11,357 |
| White Hake | 2019 | 3,898 | 2,938 | 29 | 29 | | 2,735 | 2,735 | | 2,715 | 21 | | 2,794 |
| | 2020 | 3,916 | 2,938 | 29 | 29 | | 2,735 | 2,735 | | 2,715 | 21 | | 2,794 |
| Pollock | 2019 | 53,940 | 40,172 | 402 | 402 | | 37,400 | 37,400 | | 37,170 | 230 | | 38,204 |
| | 2020 | 57,240 | 40,172 | 402 | 402 | | 37,400 | 37,400 | | 37,170 | 230 | | 38,204 |
| GOM/GB | 2019 | 122 | 92 | 2 | 3 | 18 | 63 | 63 | | | 63 | | 86 |
| Windowpane Flounder | 2020 | 122 | 92 | 2 | 3 | 18 | 63 | 63 | | | 63 | | 86 |
| SNE/MA | 2019 | 631 | 473 | 28 | 218 | 158 | 53 | 53 | | | 53 | | 457 |
| Windowpane Flounder | 2020 | 631 | 473 | 28 | 218 | 158 | 53 | 53 | | | 53 | | 457 |
| Ocean Pout | 2019 | 169 | 127 | 3 | 23 | | 94 | 94 | | | 94 | | 120 |
| | 2020 | 169 | 127 | 3 | 23 | | 94 | 94 | | | 94 | | 120 |
| Atlantic | 2019 | | 104 | 21 | 2 | | 77 | 77 | | | 77 | | 100 |
| Halibut | 2020 | | 104 | 21 | 2 | | 77 | 77 | | | 77 | | 100 |
| Atlantic | 2019 | 120 | 90 | 1 | 1 | | 82 | 82 | | | 82 | | 84 |
| Wolffish | 2020 | 120 | 90 | 1 | 1 | | 82 | 82 | | | 82 | | 84 |

4.1.2.2 Option 2: Revised Annual Catch Limit Specifications

Under Option 2, the annual specification for FY2019 – FY2020 for GB cod, GOM cod, GB haddock, GB yellowtail flounder, witch flounder, GB winter flounder, GOM winter flounder, and Atlantic halibut would be as specified as in Table 5. Option 2 includes adjustments to the state waters and other subcomponent values from those specified in FW57 under the No Action alternative (see Appendix II for additional information on the PDT's sub-component analysis), based on the PDT recommendations. All other specifications would remain unchanged from those adopted through FW57. Table 6 provides the allocation to the Closed Area I Hook Gear Haddock SAP.

<u>U.S./Canada Total Allowable Catches</u>

This alternative would specify total allowable catches (TACs) for the U.S./Canada Management Area for FY 2019 as indicated in Table 3. If NMFS determines that FY 2018 catch of GB cod, haddock, or yellowtail flounder from the U.S./Canada Management Area exceeded the respective 2018 TAC, the U.S./Canada Resource Sharing Understanding and the regulations require that the 2019 TAC be reduced by the amount of the overage. Any overage reduction would be applied to the components of the fishery that caused the overage of the U.S. TAC in 2018. To minimize any disruption to the fishing industry, NMFS would attempt to make any necessary TAC adjustment in the first quarter of the fishing year.

A comparison of the proposed FY 2019 U.S. TACs and the FY 2018 U.S. TACs is shown in Table 4. Changes to the U.S. TACs reflect changes to the percentage shares, stock status, and the TMGC's recommendations.

Table 3 - Proposed FY2019 U.S./Canada TACs (mt).

| | Eastern GB Cod | Eastern GB Haddock | GB Yellowtail Flounder |
|------------------|----------------|--------------------|---------------------------|
| Total Shared TAC | 650 | 30,000 | 140 |
| U.S. TAC | 189 | 15,000 | 106 |
| Canada TAC | 461 | 15,000 | 34 |

Table 4 - Comparison of the Proposed FY 2018 U.S. TACs and the FY 2017 U.S. TACs (mt).

| Stock | U.S. T | AC | Percent Change ((FY2019-FY2018) | | |
|------------------------|---------|---------|------------------------------------|--|--|
| | FY 2019 | FY 2018 | /FY2018)*100 | | |
| Eastern GB cod | 189 | 257 | -26% | | |
| Eastern GB haddock | 15,000 | 15,600 | -4% | | |
| GB yellowtail flounder | 106 | 213 | -50% | | |

Table 5 - Option 2 Revised Northeast Multispecies OFLs, ABC, ACLs, and other ACL sub-components for FY2019-FY2020 (metric tons, live weight), based on final sector rosters for 2018. Values are rounded to the nearest metric ton. Stocks which are underlined would be subject to adjustments in 2020 based on US/CA quotas. Includes adjustments to state waters and other sub-components for some stocks based on the PDT's recommendation and Canadian catches. Stocks in gray were not adjusted from those specification adopted through FW57.

| <u>GB Cod</u> 2019 3,047 1,824 27 146 1,568 1,568 | | Preliminary Non-sector Ground- fish | MWT or Small Sub-ACL | |
|---|------------------|---|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| | 1,536 | 32 | | 1,741 |
| <u>2020 3,047 2,285 34 183 1,965 1,965</u> | <u>1,925</u> | <u>40</u> | | 2,182 |
| GOM Cod 2019 938 703 70 14 583 363 220 | 352 | 11 | | 667 |
| 2020 938 703 70 14 583 363 220 | 352 | 11 | | 667 |
| <u>GB Haddock</u> 2019 99,757 58,114 581 581 53,276 53,276 2020 100,825 73,114 731 731 67,027 67,027 | 52,896 66,549 | 380 478 | 811 1,020 | 55,249 <u>69,509</u> |
| GOM Haddock 2019 16,038 12,490 91 91 11,506 8,312 3,194 | 8,219 | 93 | 116 | 11,803 |
| 2020 13,020 10,186 74 74 9,384 6,779 2,605 | 6,703 | 76 | 95 | 9,626 |
| <u>GB Yellowtail</u> 2019 106 17 85 85 | 83 | 1 | 2 | 103 |
| Flounder 2020 168 26 134 134 | <u>132</u> | <u>2</u> | <u>3</u> | <u>163</u> |
| SNE/MA 2019 90 68 2 17 4 42 42 | 34 | 8 | | 66 |
| Yellowtail 2020 90 68 2 17 15 32 32 Flounder | 26 | 6 | | 66 |
| CC/GOM 2019 736 511 51 41 398 398 | 381 | 17 | | 490 |
| Yellowtail 2020 848 511 51 41 398 398 Flounder | 381 | 17 | | 490 |
| American 2019 2,099 1,609 32 32 1,467 1,467 | 1,442 | 26 | | 1,532 |
| Plaice 2020 1,945 1,492 30 30 1,361 1,361 | 1,337 | 24 | | 1,420 |
| Witch Flounder 2019 993 45 60 844 844 | 826 | 18 | | 949 |
| 2020 993 45 60 844 844 | 826 | 18 | | 949 |
| GB Winter 2019 1,182 810 12 774 774 | 768 | 6 | | 786 |
| Flounder 2020 1,756 810 12 774 774 | 768 | 6 | | 786 |
| GOM Winter 2019 596 447 123 9 299 299 | 285 | 15 | | 431 |
| Flounder 2020 596 447 123 9 299 299 | 285 | 15 | | 431 |

| Stock | Year | OFL | US ABC | State-Waters Sub- Component | Other sub- components | Scallops | Groundfish Sub-ACL | Comm. Ground-fish Sub-ACL | Rec Ground-fish Sub- ACL | Preliminary Sectors Sub-ACL | Preliminary Non-sector Ground- fish | MWT or Small mesh Sub-ACL | Total ACL |
|------------------------|------|--------|-----------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|----------|--------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|---|------------------------------|--------------|
| SNE/MA | 2019 | 1,228 | 727 | 73 | 109 | | 518 | 518 | | 456 | 62 | | 700 |
| Winter Flounder | 2020 | 1,228 | 727 | 73 | 109 | | 518 | 518 | | 456 | 62 | | 700 |
| Redfish | 2019 | 15,640 | 11,785 | 118 | 118 | | 10,972 | 10,972 | | 10,921 | 51 | | 11,208 |
| | 2020 | 15,852 | 11,942 | 119 | 119 | | 11,118 | 11,118 | | 11,066 | 52 | | 11,357 |
| White Hake | 2019 | 3,898 | 2,938 | 29 | 29 | | 2,735 | 2,735 | | 2,715 | 21 | | 2,794 |
| | 2020 | 3,916 | 2,938 | 29 | 29 | | 2,735 | 2,735 | | 2,715 | 21 | | 2,794 |
| Pollock | 2019 | 53,940 | 40,172 | 402 | 402 | | 37,400 | 37,400 | | 37,170 | 230 | | 38,204 |
| | 2020 | 57,240 | 40,172 | 402 | 402 | | 37,400 | 37,400 | | 37,170 | 230 | | 38,204 |
| GOM/GB | 2019 | 122 | 92 | 2 | 3 | 18 | 63 | 63 | | | 63 | | 86 |
| Windowpane Flounder | 2020 | 122 | 92 | 2 | 3 | 18 | 63 | 63 | | | 63 | | 86 |
| SNE/MA | 2019 | 631 | 473 | 28 | 218 | 158 | 53 | 53 | | | 53 | | 457 |
| Windowpane Flounder | 2020 | 631 | 473 | 28 | 218 | 158 | 53 | 53 | | | 53 | | 457 |
| Ocean Pout | 2019 | 169 | 127 | 3 | 23 | | 94 | 94 | | | 94 | | 120 |
| | 2020 | 169 | 127 | 3 | 23 | | 94 | 94 | | | 94 | | 120 |
| Atlantic Halibut | 2019 | | 104 | 41 | 4 | | 56 | 56 | | | 56 | | 101 |
| | 2020 | | 104 | 41 | 4 | | 56 | 56 | | | 56 | | 101 |
| Atlantic | 2019 | 120 | 90 | 1 | 1 | | 82 | 82 | | | 82 | | 84 |
| Wolffish | 2020 | 120 | 90 | 1 | 1 | | 82 | 82 | | | 82 | | 84 |

Table 6- CAI Hook Gear Haddock SAP TACs (FY2019 - FY2020). [to be updated]

| Year | Exploitable Biomass | Western Georges Bank Exploitable | B(year)/B(2004) | TAC (mt, live weight) |
|-----------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------|-----------------------|
| | (thousand mt) | Biomass | | |
| 2019 | 238,522 | 83,483 | 3.057 | 3,454 |
| 2020 | 253,621 | 88,767 | 3.250 | 3,673 |

4.2 Fishery Program Administration

4.2.1 Minimum Fish Size Exemptions for Vessels Fishing in NAFO Waters

4.2.1.1 Option 1: No Action

No action. Under no action, U.S. vessels participating in the NAFO fishery would continue to be prohibited from possessing any fish, including parts of fish, that do not meet the minimum fish size in the domestic fishery.

4.2.1.2 Option 2: Exempt vessels fishing in NAFO waters from Northeast Multispecies Fishery Management Plan (FMP) commercial minimum fish sizes

Under Option 2, U.S. vessels fishing exclusively in NAFO waters would be exempt from the domestic fishery minimum sizes, and instead would be required to land fish that met the NAFO minimum sizes, shown in Table 7.

Table 7- NAFO and Domestic Minimum Fish Sizes.

| Species | Gilled and gu | Domestic Minimum Sizes | | | |
|------------------------|---------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|
| | Whole | Head Off | Head and Tail Off | Head Off and Split | Whole |
| Atlantic cod | 41 cm | 27 cm | 22 cm | 27/25 cm** | 19 in (48.3 cm) |
| Greenland halibut | 30 cm | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| American plaice | 25 cm | 19 cm | 15 cm | N/A | 12 in (30.5 cm) |
| Yellowtail flounder | 25 cm | 19 cm | 15 cm | N/A | 12 in (30.5 cm) |

^{*} Fish size refers to fork length for Atlantic cod, whole length for other species

^{**} Lower size for green salted fish.

Rationale: The NAFO stocks are distinct from the stocks managed by the Northeast Multispecies Fishery Management Plan. Therefore, harvest of those stocks does not have a biological impact on U.S. stocks. NAFO fishing trips require 100-percent observer coverage. All catch that comes onboard the vessel is identified and quantified following NAFO protocols by the fisheries observer. Allowing U.S. vessels to harvest fish using NAFO minimum sizes enables the United States to be better stewards of the NAFO resource by reducing discards that meet the NAFO size standards but are below the domestic minimum size.

Landing the dressed fish, even at sizes less than the domestic minimum size, would not likely put the NAFO participants at a competitive advantage over domestic fishermen, but would allow competition with foreign interests, because the NAFO catch is mainly intended for the frozen market currently dominated by foreign interests. Option 2 applies to all NAFO stocks to proactively facilitate development of U.S. participation in NAFO as well as addressing the stocks (yellowtail flounder and American plaice) already being landed in the U.S.

4.2.1.3 Option 3: Exempt vessels fishing in NAFO waters from Northeast Multispecies Fishery Management Plan (FMP) commercial minimum fish sizes for yellowtail flounder and American plaice only

Under Option 3, U.S. vessels fishing exclusively in NAFO waters would be exempt from the domestic fishery minimum sizes, and instead would be required to land fish that met the NAFO minimum sizes, shown in Table 7, for only yellowtail flounder and American plaice.

Rationale: The rationale is the same as for Option 2 above, except Option 3 would limit the exemption to yellowtail flounder and American plaice because those are the only two stocks that that are currently being landed in the U.S. by NAFO participants.

4.2.2 <u>Guidance on Sector Overages</u>

Amendment 13 and Amendment 16 addressed sector overages. The term "sector overage" means exceeding an allocation in year one after any ACE transfers have occurred with the result that the sector will receive a deduction of ACE in year two.

4.2.2.1 Option 1: No Action

Under no action, NMFS would continue to follow the regulations implemented as a part of Amendment 16 and the guidance for addressing sector overages provided in Amendment 13 and Amendment 16. The regulations state that:

- If a sector exceeds its allocation in a given year, the overage is deducted from the sector's allocation the following year. Any impacts on departing members may be specified and addressed by the sector operations plan and sector contract rather than by regulation. This provides the most flexibility and can be done through indemnification provisions and other legal constructs. Existing sectors have already incorporated provisions that address this situation.
- In the event the sector disbands in the year following an overage, the individual permits that were enrolled in the sector in the fishing year in which the overage occurred are responsible for

- payback. This is done by either an ACE reduction, if the permit enrolls in a different sector, or a DAS reduction, if the permit moves to the common pool.
- If the sector does not disband, but has insufficient ACE to cover an overage, that sector's ACE for the stock for which the overage occurred shall be temporarily reduced to zero for the following fishing year, and that sector shall be prohibited from fishing on a sector trip in the stock area associated with the stock for which the ACE was exceeded during the following year, unless and until that sector can acquire sufficient ACE from another sector to cover the remaining overage from the previous fishing year.

4.2.2.2 Option 2: Provide Additional Guidance on Sector Overages

Under Option 2, XXX

Rationale: XXXX