

**Draft Motions**  
Scallop Committee Meeting  
December 3, 2021  
Webinar

Selection of Preferred Alternatives in Scallop Framework 34:

**Motion 1: Hughes/Smith**

Recommend that the Council adopt in Section 4.1, Alternative 4.1.2, Updated OFL and ABC for FY 2022 and FY 2023, as the preferred alternative.

*Rationale:* This alternative contains the most recent and up to date information on the fishery and represents the best available science. Alternative 2 was supported by the PDT and the Scallop AP.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
<b>Scallop Committee</b>				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO	YES			
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
<b>TOTAL VOTE</b>	11	0	0	0

**The motion carried 11-0-0.**

**Motion 2: Smith/Zobel**

Move to select in Section 4.2, Alternative 2, Option 2: Re-open Stellwagen Bank and set NGOM TAL using A21 approach; Set the NGOM TAL at F=0.18 with set-asides to support research, monitoring, and a directed LAGC fishery, as preferred.

*Rationale:* Fishing the NGOM at F=0.18 maintains the conservative approach that has been taken in recent seasons with NGOM and is at the lower end of the fishing mortality range (F=0.15 to F=0.25) as prescribed in A21. Harvesting at F=0.18 will allow for the remainder of the scallop resource on Stellwagen to continue growing out while balancing the anticipated increase in effort within the LAGC fleet. Additionally, this allows for a slightly higher set-aside to contribute towards the ongoing research and monitoring necessary for the sustainability of the NGOM resource. The F=0.18 is lower than the F=0.2 that the Council used when setting the NGOM TAC in recent actions.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO	YES			
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC		NO		
Peter Hughes, MAFMC		NO		
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	9	2	0	0

**The motion carried 9-2-0.**

**Motion 3: Alexander/Hughes**

Move that the Committee recommend that the Council adopt as the final preferred alternative for Section 4.3: Alternative 3, Three Access Area Trips, with the Hudson Canyon and Elephant Trunk reverted to open bottom and closures of the New York Bight and Nantucket Lightship. This includes.

- 15,000 pound trip limits in access areas for full-time Limited Access vessels.
- 3 access area trips with the following allocations:
- Closed Area II: 30,000 pounds (2 trips)
- NLS-South trip at 15,000 pounds (1 trip)
- One 15,000 pound default access area trip to CAII for FY 2023

The Committee recommends that the council adopt neither options 1 or 2, but rather add an intermediate option for Open Areas Fished at F=0.39 with 24 DAS, as demonstrated in the sensitivity analysis presented in section 4.3.3.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Emily Gilbert, GARFO	YES			
John Pappalardo, MA	YES			
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC	YES			
Peter Hughes, MAFMC	YES			
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	11	0	0	0

**The motion carried 11-0-0.**

#### **Motion 4: Hughes/Pappalardo**

Recommend that the Council adopt in Section 4.4, Alternative 2 (4.4.2) Update LAGC IFQ Access Area Trip Allocations, Distribute Closed Area II Access Area Allocation only to Closed Area I, as preferred. The distribution of all allocated trips would be:

- 357 LAGC IFQ trips in NLS-S
- 714 LAGC IFQ trips in CAI

*Rationale:* This option gives the LAGC more equity in the value of their scallops. There is a lot of access headed to NLS-South by the LA component, but very limited LAGC IFQ fishing in that area. Allowing the LAGC to fish in CAI where there will only be RSA compensation fishing is a positive from a fishery perspective.

*The motion carried without objection.*

#### **Motion 5: Hughes/Smith**

Recommend that the Council adopt in Section 4.5, Alternative 2 (4.5.2), allow RSA compensation fishing in open areas and the NLS-South, Closed Area II, and Closed Area I, with limited RSA compensation fishing in the NGOM Management Area, as the preferred alternative.

*Rationale:* Allows flexibility to use RSA compensation pounds in all open rotational areas so vessels can operate in areas where they target larger market grades. Increases the diversity of where you can fish the RSA trips.

*The motion carried without objection.*

**Motion 6: Etrie/Smith**

The Committee recommends that the Council use a multi-step process to consider LA leasing by beginning with scoping, and modify the Executive Committee’s priorities recommendations by removing listening sessions from the annual leasing work priority:

“Conduct scoping for a LA DAS and AA trips leasing program to assess the need for a leasing program and whether to move forward with developing an amendment.”

*Rationale:* This is to clarify the Committee’s prior motion from October 2021. The two-step process would allow the Council to ask stakeholders if they support LA leasing of DAS and access area allocations.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop Committee				
Melanie Griffin, MA (Chair)				
Togue Brawn, ME	YES			
Emily Gilbert, GARFO			Abstain	
Libby Etrie, MA	YES			
John Pappalardo, MA		NO		
Melissa Smith, ME	YES			
Renee Zobel, NH	YES			
Matt Gates, CT	YES			
Michelle Duval, MAFMC		NO		
Peter Hughes, MAFMC		NO		
Mark Alexander (VC)	YES			
Eric Reid, RI (Chair)				
Dr. Michael Sissenwine, MA		NO		
TOTAL VOTE	6	4	1	0

*The meeting ended at 2:24pm.*

**Draft Motions**  
 Scallop Advisory Panel Meeting  
 December 2, 2021  
 Webinar

Selection of Preferred Alternatives in Scallop Framework 34:

**Motion 1: Larson/Hansen**

Recommend that the Committee adopt in Section 4.1, Alternative 4.1.2, Updated OFL and ABC for FY 2022 and FY 2023, as the preferred alternative.

*Rationale:* This alternative contains the most recent and up to date information on the fishery and represents the best available science. Alternative 2 was supported by the PDT.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Kristen Porter				
Kirk Larson	YES			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Charlie Quinn				
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Ben Martens	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	14	0	0	0

**The motion carried 14-0-0.**

**Motion 2: Martens/Vafides**

Recommends that the Committee adopt in Section 4.2, Alternative 2, Option 2, Re-open Stellwagen Bank and set NGOM TAL, with set-asides to support research, monitoring, and a directed LAGC fishery, Set the NGOM TAL at F=0.18, as preferred.

*Rationale:* Fishing the NGOM at F=0.18 is a conservative approach. This is an appropriate level of fishing with the transition to management approaches recommended in Amendment 21.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen		No		
Jay Elsner		No		
Paul Vafides	Yes			
Michael Marchetti		No		
Kristen Porter				
Kirk Larson		No		
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)		No		
Ed Mullis		No		
Chris Merl		No		
Charlie Quinn		No		
Cassie Canastra		No		
Wes Brighton		No		
Brent Fulcher		No		
Brady Lybarger		No		
Bob Maxwell		No		
Ben Martens	Yes			
TOTAL VOTE	2	13	0	0

**The motion failed 2-13-0.**

**Motion 3: Martens/Lybarger**

Recommends that the Committee adopt in Section 4.2, Alternative 2, Option 1, Re-open Stellwagen Bank and set NGOM TAL, with set-asides to support research, monitoring, and a directed LAGC fishery, Set the NGOM TAL at F=0.15, as preferred.

*Rationale:* This is the PDT recommended alternative. Fishing the NGOM at F=0.15 is a conservative approach. This is an appropriate level of fishing with the transition to management approaches recommended in Amendment 21.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Kristen Porter				
Kirk Larson	YES			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Ed Mullis	YES			
Chris Merl	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Ben Martens	YES			
TOTAL VOTE	15	0	0	0

**The motion carried 15-0-0.**



**Motion 4: Hansen/Lybarger**

Recommend that the Committee adopt in Section 4.3, Alternative 3, Option 2, Three Access Area Trips, with the Hudson Canyon and Elephant Trunk reverted to open bottom and closures of the New York Bight and Nantucket Lightship West with 26 FT LA DAS, as preferred. This includes:

- 26 FT LA DAS (Open area F=0.45).
- 15,000 pound trip limit for full-time Limited Access vessels.
- 3 access area trips with the following allocations:
  - Closed Area II: 30,000 pounds (2 trips)
  - NLS-South trip at 15,000 pounds (1 trip)
- One 15,000 pound default access area trip to CAII for FY 2023

*Rationale:* Projected landings would be ~36 mil. lbs, which is a reduction from the projected 2021 harvest. This option balances short term and long term interests of the resource and fishery. The F=0.45 is well below the allowable open area F of F=0.61. This alternative uses a closure in the Mid-Atlantic to protect small scallops. Looking to avoid major swings in supply which are harmful to the health of the fishery. The LPUE estimate of 2,300 pounds is likely overestimated and realized LPUE will likely be less than that in 2022. Lower trip limits are a more conservative approach (15,000 vs. 18,000).

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Ben Martens	YES			
Bob Maxwell		NO		
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Chris Merl		NO		
Ed Mullis	YES			
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Kirk Larson	YES			
Kristen Porter				
Michael Marchetti		NO		
Paul Vafides		NO		
Ronnie Enoksen		NO		
Tom Coley				
TOTAL VOTE	10	5	0	0

**The motion carried 10-5-0.**

**Motion 5: Elsner/Larson**

Recommend that the Committee adopt in Section 4.4, Alternative 3 (4.4.3) Update LAGC IFQ Access Area Trip Allocations, Distribute Closed Area II Access Area Allocation Evenly to Closed Area I and NLS-South, as preferred. The distribution of all allocated trips would be:

- 714 LAGC IFQ trips in NLS-S
- 357 LAGC IFQ trips in CAI

*Rationale:* This option would preserve the resource in each area as much as possible. NLS-S has more biomass than Closed Area I.

Motion to Amend

**Motion 5a: Fulcher/Lybarger**

Recommend that the Committee adopt in Section 4.4, Alternative 2 (4.4.2) Update LAGC IFQ Access Area Trip Allocations, Distribute Closed Area II Access Area Allocation only to Closed Area I, as preferred. The distribution of all allocated trips would be:

- 357 LAGC IFQ trips in NLS-S
- 714 LAGC IFQ trips in CAI

*Rationale:* This option gives the LAGC more equity in the value of their scallops. There is a lot of access headed to NLS-South. Allowing the LAGC to fish in CAI where there will only be RSA compensation fishing is a positive from a fishery perspective.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Paul Vafides		NO		
Michael Marchetti		NO		
Kristen Porter				
Kirk Larson	YES			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Ed Mullis				
Chris Merl	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Bob Maxwell		NO		
Ben Martens		NO		
TOTAL VOTE	10	4	0	0

**The motion to amended carried 10-4-0.**

**Motion 5a: The main motion as amended:**

Recommend that the Committee adopt in Section 4.4, Alternative 2 (4.4.2) Update LAGC IFQ Access Area Trip Allocations, Distribute Closed Area II Access Area Allocation only to Closed Area I, as preferred. The distribution of all allocated trips would be:

- 357 LAGC IFQ trips in NLS-S
- 714 LAGC IFQ trips in CAI

*Rationale:* This option gives the LAGC more equity in the value of their scallops. There is a lot of access headed to NLS-South. Allowing the LAGC to fish in CAI where there will only be RSA compensation fishing is a positive from a fishery perspective.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	YES			
Jay Elsner	YES			
Paul Vafides	YES			
Michael Marchetti	YES			
Kristen Porter				
Kirk Larson	YES			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	YES			
Ed Mullis				
Chris Merl	YES			
Charlie Quinn	YES			
Cassie Canastra	YES			
Wes Brighton	YES			
Brent Fulcher	YES			
Brady Lybarger	YES			
Bob Maxwell	YES			
Ben Martens				
TOTAL VOTE	13	0	0	0

**The main motion as amended carried 13-0-0.**

**Motion 6: Hansen/Larson**

Recommend that the Committee adopt in Section 4.5, Alternative 2 (4.5.2), allow RSA compensation fishing in open areas and the NLS-South, Closed Area II, and Closed Area I, with limited RSA compensation fishing in the NGOM Management Area, as the preferred alternative.

*Rationale:* Allows flexibility to use RSA compensation pounds in all open rotational areas so vessels can operate in areas where they target larger market grades. Increases the diversity of where you can fish the RSA trips.

	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse
Scallop AP				
Tom Coley				
Ronnie Enoksen	Yes			
Jay Elsner	Yes			
Paul Vafides	Yes			
Michael Marchetti	Yes			
Kristen Porter				
Kirk Larson	Yes			
James Gutowski (Chair)				
Eric Hansen (VC)	Yes			
Ed Mullis				
Chris Merl	Yes			
Charlie Quinn	Yes			
Cassie Canastra	Yes			
Wes Brighton	Yes			
Brent Fulcher	Yes			
Brady Lybarger	Yes			
Bob Maxwell	Yes			
Ben Martens				
TOTAL VOTE	13	0	0	0

**The motion carried 13-0-0.**

*The meeting ended at 2:09pm.*